

Jonathan M. Rotter (SBN 234137)
GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP
1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100
Los Angeles, California 90067
Telephone: (310) 201-9150
Facsimile: (310) 432-1495
Email: info@glancylaw.com

Carl L. Stine (*pro hac vice*)
Matthew Insley-Pruitt (*pro hac vice*)
Philip M. Black (SBN 308619)
WOLF POPPER LLP
845 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
Telephone: (212) 759-4600
Facsimile: (212) 486-2093
Email: cstine@wolfpopper.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Proposed Class

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

SHARAE CASEY, Individually
and on Behalf of All Others
Similarly Situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

DOCTOR'S BEST, INC.,

Defendant.

)
) Case No. 8:20-cv-01325-JLS-JDE

)
) **DECLARATION OF JONATHAN**
) **ROTTER IN SUPPORT OF**
) **UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR**
) **FINAL APPROVAL OF**
) **SETTLEMENT**

) Date: July 8, 2022

) Time: 10:30 a.m.

) Courtroom: 8A

1 I, Jonathan Rotter, declare:

2 1. I am a partner with the law firm of Glancy Prongay & Murray LLP
3 (“GPM”) and have been the lead lawyer at GPM working on this case. I submit this
4 declaration in support of Plaintiffs’ motion for final approval of the proposed class
5 action settlement and award of attorneys fees, costs, and expenses.

6 2. I have been practicing law or clerking for federal judges since my
7 graduation, with honors, from Harvard Law School in 2004, where I served as an
8 editor of the Harvard Journal of Law and Technology and was a Fellow in Law and
9 Economics at the John M. Olin Center for Law, Economics, and Business, and a
10 Fellow in Justice, Welfare, and Economics at the Harvard University Weatherhead
11 Center for International Affairs. My practice has been concentrated in complex
12 cases and technology, and I served for three years as the first law clerk for the Patent
13 Pilot Program for the United States District Court for the Central District of
14 California. I also clerked on the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit.
15 During the past five years, the majority of my time has been spent representing
16 Plaintiffs in class action litigation.

17 3. GPM, one of the premier plaintiffs’ class action firms in the country,
18 has been protecting consumers for more than 25 years and has significant knowledge
19 and experience handling class actions, complex litigation and the types of claims
20 involved in this case. GPM’s practice exclusively focuses on class actions and other
21 complex litigation in state and federal courts all around the country. I previously
22 submitted the biography of Glancy Prongay & Murray LLP, including the individual
23 attorneys who have participated in this matter. ECF No. 44-1.

24 3. During the course of the action, my firm has served as co-counsel
25 assisting lead counsel Wolf Popper LLC, and in that capacity assisted with
26 evaluating the case pre-filing, contributed to the Complaint, assisted with the
27 opposition to the Motion to dismiss, participated in conferences (remote) and
28 correspondence with plaintiff’s and defendant’s teams, attended the mediation,

1 edited the Settlement agreement, assisted with the preliminary approval motion,
 2 issued subpoenas to retailers and engaged in extensive follow up communications
 3 and negotiations to obtain the class member data used for the notice program, and
 4 assisted with the motion for final approval.

5 4. We anticipate continuing to spend time working on this matter after
 6 filing the motion for final approval, including working on any responsive or
 7 supplemental filings, attending the final approval hearing, and assisting as needed
 8 with subsequent case tasks.

9 5. GPM's lodestar for this case is \$72,095. Attached hereto as Exhibit A
 10 is a spreadsheet reflecting the time spent by GPM on this case. In accordance with
 11 the Court's direction, each billed task in Exhibit A is set forth on a separate line that
 12 consists of the following columns: (1) in "date" format, the date the task was
 13 performed; (2) the timekeeper (attorney or paralegal) performing the task; (3) a
 14 description of the task performed; (4) in "number" or "currency" format, the hourly
 15 rate of the relevant timekeeper; (5) in "number" format, the time expended on the
 16 task; and (6) as a formula, a calculation of the fee charged for each task. An Excel
 17 file corresponding to Exhibit A will be sent to Chambers by email. Below is a
 18 summary chart of the time incurred by GPM in this case:

TIMEKEEPER	STATUS	HOURS	RATE	LODESTAR
Jonathan M. Rotter	Partner	64.40	850.00	\$54,740.00
Harry Kharadjian	Senior Paralegal	5.50	325.00	\$1,787.50
Paul Harrigan	Senior Paralegal	37.90	325.00	\$12,317.50
Zabella Moore	Senior Paralegal	10.00	325.00	\$3,250.00
TOTAL LODESTAR	TOTAL	117.80		\$72,095.00

25
 26 6. The hourly rates for the attorneys and professional support staff of my
 27 Firm included are the same as the regular rates charged for their services in non-
 28 contingent matters and/or which have been accepted in other complex or class action

1 litigation. My firm undertook this matter on a purely contingent basis. GPM's rates
 2 "are comparable to peer plaintiffs and defense-side law firms litigating matters of
 3 similar magnitude." *Lea v. TAL Educ. Grp.*, 2021 WL 5578665, at *12 (S.D.N.Y.
 4 Nov. 30, 2021) (approving GPM's 2021 rates of \$600 to \$995 for partners, and \$500
 5 to \$750 for associates); *Yaron v. Intersect ENT, Inc.*, 2021 WL 5150051, at *2 (N.D.
 6 Cal. Nov. 5, 2021) (accepting GPM's rates as part of lodestar cross-check); *In re*
 7 *CytRx Corp. Sec. Litig.*, 2018 WL 8950655, at *1, *2 (C.D. Cal. Sept. 17, 2019)
 8 (same), *In re K12 Inc. Sec. Litig.*, 2019 WL 3766420, at *2 (N.D. Cal. July 10, 2019)
 9 (same).

10 7. GPM's expenses, reasonably and necessarily expended for the benefit
 11 of the Class in this action, are \$2,998.11, as reflected on the books and records of
 12 my firm. These books and records are prepared from expense vouchers, check
 13 records, and other source materials and are an accurate record of the expenses
 14 incurred. Below is a chart summarizing the expenses by category:

CATEGORY OF EXPENSE	AMOUNT
COURT FILING FEES	\$1,200.00
ONLINE RESEARCH	\$543.86
SERVICE OF PROCESS	\$1,254.25
GRAND TOTAL	\$2,998.11

20 8. I am not aware of any relationship between the proposed cy pres
 21 recipient, the Arthritis National Research Foundation, on the one hand, and GPM or
 22 its members, on the other hand.

23 9. Based on my and GPM's significant experience in class action
 24 litigation, I believe that the settlement presented to the Court is fair, reasonable, and
 25 adequate.
 26
 27
 28

1 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

2
3 DATED: May 20, 2022

/s/ Jonathan M. Rotter

Jonathan M. Rotter

4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

SHARAE CASEY ET AL. V. DOCTORS BEST, INC. CDCAL 8:20-CV-01325 JLS-JDE					
TIME RECORDS OF GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP					
Date	Timekeeper	Task Description	Hourly Rate	Hours Worked	Fee (Hourly Rate x Hours Worked)
7/20/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE COMPLAINT AND CLRA LETTER	850.00	0.30	255.00
7/21/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVISE CLRA LETTER, CORRESPONDENCE RE COMPLAINT	850.00	0.40	340.00
7/22/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	FINALIZE AND FILE COMPLAINT	850.00	0.60	510.00
7/28/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	PRO HAC FILINGS	850.00	0.40	340.00
7/29/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	PRO HAC FILINGS	850.00	0.40	340.00
8/5/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW MATERIALS FROM OTHER GLUCOSAMINE CASE DEFENDED BY COVINGTON, EMAIL RE EXTENSION REQUEST	850.00	0.50	425.00
8/11/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE COMPLAINT	850.00	0.10	85.00
8/12/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE EXTENSION, RELATED CASE	850.00	0.30	255.00
9/16/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW CHEMICAL TESTING OF DEFENDANT'S PRODUCT	850.00	0.60	510.00
9/21/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALL WITH LABORATORY	850.00	0.50	425.00
9/25/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALL RE CHEMICAL TESTING	850.00	0.50	425.00
10/7/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CASE CORRESPONDENCE	850.00	0.30	255.00
10/12/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CONFERENCES RE CHEMICAL TESTING	850.00	0.50	425.00
10/28/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE COURT ORDER	850.00	0.20	170.00
12/1/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE POTENTIAL SETTLEMENT STRUCTURE	850.00	0.70	595.00
12/2/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	MEET AND CONFER RE MTD, CORRESPONDENCE RE SETTLEMENT	850.00	0.90	765.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

12/10/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALENDAR AND FILE MTD	850.00	0.20	170.00
12/14/2020	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALENDAR BRIEFING DATES	850.00	0.30	255.00
1/5/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	RESEAR+C46CH AND CORRESPONDENCE RE JUDGE STATON PRACTICE RE SCHEDULING ORDERS, CONFERENCE AND CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.70	595.00
1/6/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SCHEDULING ORDER PRACTICES	850.00	0.30	255.00
1/7/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CONFERENCE RE STRATEGY, RESEARCH RE SAME	850.00	0.30	255.00
2/1/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALL RE POTENTIAL MEDIATION	850.00	0.50	425.00
2/12/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CONFERENCES RE 26F REPORT	850.00	0.50	425.00
2/19/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW 26(F) REPORT, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.50	425.00
3/17/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	RESEARCH RE MEDIATORS	850.00	0.40	340.00
3/17/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	RESEARCH RE MEDIATORS	850.00	0.40	340.00
3/19/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE MEDIATION	850.00	0.10	85.00
4/5/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	MEDIATION CORRESPONDENCE AND DOCUMENT REVIEW	850.00	0.50	425.00
4/6/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVISE MEDIATION BRIEF, OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO DISMISS, CORRESPONDENCE AND CALLS RE SAME	850.00	2.00	1,700.00
4/12/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	ANALYZE TERM SHEET, PRODUCTS, ARGUMENTS, PREPARE FOR MEDIATION	850.00	1.50	1,275.00
4/13/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	ATTEND MEDIATION, FOLLOW-UP RE SAME	850.00	8.10	6,885.00
4/15/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVISE SHORT FORM SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	850.00	0.80	680.00
4/19/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW TERM SHEET EDITS, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.50	425.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

4/20/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SETTLEMENT AND RELATED FILINGS - NOTICE AND PROPOSED ORDER	850.00	0.50	425.00
5/11/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	ATTENTION TO AMAZON SUBPOENA	850.00	0.40	340.00
5/22/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	ATTENTION TO AMAZON SUBPOENA	850.00	0.30	255.00
5/23/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	AMAZON SUBPOENA CORRESPONDENCE	850.00	0.60	510.00
5/31/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	ANALYZE AMAZON SUBPOENA RESPONSE, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.40	340.00
6/2/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	COMMENT ON SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	850.00	1.20	1,020.00
6/23/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	COMMENT ON SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT	850.00	0.60	510.00
6/28/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	RESEARCH AND CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.50	425.00
7/1/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	PREPARE SUBPOENAS TO RETAILERS	850.00	0.50	425.00
7/6/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW AND REVISE APPROVAL PAPERS, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	2.00	1,700.00
7/19/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVISE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL BRIEF	850.00	1.00	850.00
7/22/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT EDITS	850.00	0.40	340.00
7/23/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	FINALIZE AND FILE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL PAPERS, CORRESPONDENCE RE VITAMIN SHOPPE SUBPOENA	850.00	1.40	1,190.00
7/26/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENA RESPONSES - VITACOST AND VITAMIN SHOPPE	850.00	1.10	935.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

7/27/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CONFERENCE RE VITACOST SUPBPOENA, RESEARCH AND CORRESPONDENCE RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL TIMING	850.00	0.70	595.00
7/28/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE ACCELERATING DECISION ON PRELIMINARY APPROVAL	850.00	0.80	680.00
7/29/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SCHEDULE FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL, RESEARCH RE CONSENT TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME, CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENAS	850.00	2.10	1,785.00
8/2/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING	850.00	0.40	340.00
8/12/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW PROPOSED PROTECTIVE ORDER, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.50	425.00
9/16/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	SUBPOENA CORRESPONDENCE, FILE REVIEW	850.00	0.40	340.00
9/17/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALL AND CORRESPONDENCE RE SPROUTS SUBPOENA	850.00	0.30	255.00
10/21/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.30	255.00
12/13/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SETTLEMENT AND CLASS MEMBER CONTACT INFORMATION	850.00	0.30	255.00
12/14/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	RESEARCH RE JUDGE STATON FEE DECISIONS, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.80	680.00
12/15/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING, RESEARCH RE SAME	850.00	0.40	340.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

12/17/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE HEARING DATE, REPLY BRIEF, AND SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.80	680.00
12/30/2021	Jonathan M. Rotter	REVIEW REPLY BRIEF	850.00	0.40	340.00
1/3/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	PREPARE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL REPLY BRIEF FOR FILING, REVIEW DEFENSE REDLINES TO EXHIBITS, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME	850.00	0.90	765.00
1/4/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE AMENDED SETTLEMENT	850.00	0.10	85.00
1/7/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FILE AMENDED AGREEMENT UPDATE	850.00	0.40	340.00
1/12/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENAS AND NOTICE	850.00	0.50	425.00
1/14/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING AND FOLLOW UP	850.00	1.00	850.00
1/18/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FOLLOW UP ON SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.90	765.00
1/19/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FOLLOW UP ON SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.30	255.00
1/21/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	SEND FIRM RESUME FOR FOLLOW-UP SUBMISSION, FOLLOW UP ON SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.40	340.00
1/26/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FOLLOW UP ON SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.60	510.00
1/27/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FOLLOW UP ON SUBPOENAS, DRAFT SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION, REVISE FIRM RESUME, REVIEW DRAFT PAPERS	850.00	2.40	2,040.00
1/28/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	FINALIZE AND FILE SUPPLEMENTAL SUBMISSION	850.00	0.40	340.00
2/2/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Call with Amazon counsel, follow up re same	850.00	0.90	765.00
2/3/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Follow up re ASINs of products at issues (re notice)	850.00	0.30	255.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

2/4/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re subpoenas for notice program	850.00	0.40	340.00
2/7/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Follow up re subpoenas, ASINs	850.00	0.50	425.00
2/8/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re Amazon notice, check ASIN list	850.00	0.80	680.00
2/9/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re subpoenas for notice program	850.00	0.30	255.00
2/11/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Call re subpoena follow-up	850.00	0.50	425.00
2/14/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re iHerb subpoena	850.00	0.70	595.00
2/17/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re subpoenas for notice program	850.00	0.20	170.00
2/18/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re subpoenas for notice program	850.00	0.30	255.00
2/22/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re notice program	850.00	0.40	340.00
2/23/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Correspondence re notice program	850.00	0.20	170.00
2/28/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	Review preliminary approval order, correspondence re same	850.00	0.90	765.00
3/1/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE NOTICE PROGRAM, SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.70	595.00
3/3/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE NOTICE, SUBPOENAS, REVIEW REVISED DRAFTS	850.00	0.50	425.00
3/4/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE SUBPOENAS, NOTICE	850.00	0.50	425.00
3/6/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE AMAZON NOTICE, GENERATE CLEAN VERSION AND REVIEW SAME	850.00	0.40	340.00
3/7/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE WEBSITE, REVISED NOTICE LANGUAGE	850.00	0.50	425.00
3/8/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE NOTICE AND SUBPOENAS	850.00	0.40	340.00
3/9/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE AMAZON NOTICE AND VITACOST SUBPOENA	850.00	0.50	425.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

3/10/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	SUPPLEMENTAL FILING RE NOTICE	850.00	0.70	595.00
3/11/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE VITACOST SUBPOENA AND NOTICE PLAN	850.00	0.50	425.00
3/15/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE VITACOST SUBPOENA, KROLL OUTREACH RE SAME	850.00	0.20	170.00
3/16/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CONFERENCE WITH KROLL RE EMAIL CAMPAIGN DATES	850.00	0.20	170.00
3/25/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CORRESPONDENCE RE NOTICE PLAN	850.00	0.20	170.00
3/30/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	HANDLE INQUIRY FROM CLASS MEMBER	850.00	0.40	340.00
4/1/2022	Jonathan M. Rotter	CALL W/KROLL RE CONTACT INFO DATA, CORRESPONDENCE RE SAME, REVIEW CURRENT ADMINISTRATION STATISTICS	850.00	0.50	425.00
4/9/2021	Harry Kharadjian	EMAILS RE FILING	325.00	0.25	81.25
2/14/2022	Harry Kharadjian	EMAILS RE SUBPOENA	325.00	0.25	81.25
3/10/2022	Harry Kharadjian	REVISED SETTLEMENT DOCS FILING	325.00	4.00	1,300.00
3/10/2022	Harry Kharadjian	EMAILS RE FILING REVISED SETTLEMENT DOCS	325.00	0.50	162.50
3/11/2022	Harry Kharadjian	REVIEW FILED DOCS AND SEND FOR SAVING	325.00	0.50	162.50
7/22/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/FILE INITIAL COMPLAINT/ASSOCIATED DOCS; LR RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR/DLM RE SAME;	325.00	2.10	682.50
7/23/2020	Paul Harrigan	EMAIL PAY.GOV RECEIPT FOR INITIAL COMPLAINT TO BILLING; DOCKET REVIEW RE INITIAL DOCS/CASE ASSIGNMENT;	325.00	0.40	130.00
7/28/2020	Paul Harrigan	EMAIL FROM JMR RE SERVICE OF SUMMONS/COMPLAINT;	325.00	0.20	65.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

7/29/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW PHV PAPERS RE CO-COUNSEL; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME; DOCKET CHECK RE SAME;	325.00	0.50	162.50
7/30/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FINALIZE/FILE PHV MOTIONS FOR CO-COUNSEL (X2); LR/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH; GATHER SERVICE DOCUMENTS AND SCHEDULE SERVICE OF SUMMONS/COMPLAINT; DOCKET CHECK/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH RE SAME;	325.00	2.90	942.50
7/31/2020	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE RE SERVICE OF PROCESS	325.00	0.30	97.50
8/10/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAIL FROM ATTNY SERVICE; EMAIL TO CHARRON/DLM RE FILING POS; DOCKET CHECK RE SAME;	325.00	0.40	130.00
10/28/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW SCHEDULING ORDER RE MTD BRIEFING SCHEDULE; CALENDARING RE SAME;	325.00	0.30	97.50
12/15/2020	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW DOCKET/SCHEDULING ORDER/LRS RE OPP TO MTD; EMAILS W/ZM RE SAME;	325.00	0.80	260.00
4/6/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS/CONVO W/ DLM RE SERVICE OF MEDIATION BRIEF;	325.00	0.40	130.00
4/7/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAIL FROM CO-COUNSEL RE SERVICE OF MEDIATION BRIEF;	325.00	0.20	65.00
4/9/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FINALIZE/FILE OPP TO MTD; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RE SAME; EMAILS W/CO-COUNSEL/JMR RE SAME; SERVE COURTESY COPIES RE SAME;	325.00	1.40	455.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

4/12/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAILS FROM ATTNY SERVICE RE OPP TO MTD COURTESY COPIES;	325.00	0.20	65.00
4/19/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAIL FROM JMR RE NTC OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT;	325.00	0.20	65.00
4/20/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/FILE JOINT REPORT AND NTC OF SETTLEMENT; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	1.10	357.50
4/21/2021	Paul Harrigan	PREP/FINALIZE/FILE NTC OF LODGING RE PROPOSED ORDER; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	1.70	552.50
4/22/2021	Paul Harrigan	DWNLD ESTAMPED COPIES OF NTC OF SETTLEMENT/NTC OF LODGING; ARRANGE FOR COURTESY COPIES TO BE SENT TO CHAMBERS RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	0.90	292.50
4/23/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW ACCEPTANCE EMAIL FROM ATTNY SERVICE RE DELIVERING COURTESY COPIES OF NOTICE OF SETTLEMENT/NOTICE OF LODGING TO COURT;	325.00	0.70	227.50
5/7/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS W/JMR RE PREPPING SUBPOENA TO PRODUCE DOCS ON AMAZON.COM;	325.00	0.20	65.00
5/11/2021	Paul Harrigan	DRAFT SUBPOENA TO PRODUCE DOCS AND NTC OF SUBPOENA; EXEMPLAR RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	1.40	455.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

5/24/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/SERVE NTC OF SUBPOENA ON DEFENSE COUNSEL; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME; REGISTERED AGENT RESEARCH RE AMAZON.COM; PREP EMAIL TO ATTNY SERVICE RE SERVICE OF SUBPOENA ON AMAZON.COM;	325.00	1.60	520.00
6/1/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW POS RE SERVICE OF SUBPOENA ON 3RD PARTY AMAZON.COM; EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	0.40	130.00
6/9/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS W/CG RE POS RE SUBPOENA ON 3RD PARTTY AMAZON.COM; REVIEW EMAILS B/T DR/JMR RE CASE CASE ADMIN; ADD DR TO PACERPRO DISTRO LIST;	325.00	0.60	195.00
6/28/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE/GZ/JMR RE SERVICE OF SUBPOENAS ON THIRD PARTY CORPORATIONS;	325.00	0.50	162.50
6/29/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS WITH ATTNY SERVICE/JMR RE BORROWING ADDRESSES FOR DOCUMENT PRODUCTION SUBPOENAS TO 3RD PARTIES; CONFIRM VIA GOOGLE MAPS THAT ADDRESSES WERE W/IN 100 MILES OF WITNESSES;	325.00	0.60	195.00
6/30/2021	Paul Harrigan	SUBPOENA PRODUCTION ADDRESSES RESEARCH; EMAILS WITH JMR/ATTNY SERVICE RE SAME;	325.00	0.80	260.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

7/1/2021	Paul Harrigan	DRAFT NTCS OF SUBPOENA/SUBPOENAS FOR 3RD PARTY WITNESSES; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	1.20	390.00
7/6/2021	Paul Harrigan	FINALIZE/SERVE SUBPOENAS/NTCS OF SUBPOENA ON 3RD PARTY WITNESSES; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME; EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE RE SAME; REGISTERED AGENT RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE PROBLEMS WITH REGISTERED AGENTS FOR TWO WITNESSES;	325.00	2.80	910.00
7/7/2021	Paul Harrigan	DRAFT/AMEND/SERVE AMENDED NTCS OF SUBPOENA/SUBPOENAS; REGISTERED AGENT RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR/ATTNY SERVICE RE SAME;	325.00	0.90	292.50
7/8/2021	Paul Harrigan	AMEND/FINALIZE/SERVE PRODUCTION SUBPOENAS TO 3RD PARTY WITNESSES; EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE RE SAME;	325.00	1.20	390.00
7/9/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAIL/POS FROM ATTNY SERVICE RE SERVICE OF SUBPOENA ON IHERB;	325.00	0.20	65.00
7/15/2021	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW POS RE DOCUMENT SUBPOENA ON 3RD PARTY WITNESS; DWNLD DOC RE SAME; EMAILS W/ATTNY SERVICE RE SAME;	325.00	0.70	227.50
12/15/2021	Paul Harrigan	DOCKET/CALENDAR CHECK RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	0.40	130.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

12/16/2021	Paul Harrigan	DOCKET/CALENDAR/PACER CHECK RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	0.50	162.50
12/16/2021	Paul Harrigan	DOCKET/CALENDAR CHECK RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL HEARING; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	0.40	130.00
12/17/2021	Paul Harrigan	EMAILS W/JMR RE CALENDARING OF 1/14 HEARING;	325.00	0.40	130.00
1/3/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/FILE REPLY RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME; [LATE FILING]	325.00	2.50	812.50
1/7/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/FILE FURTHER REPLY RE PRELIMINARY APPROVAL; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH RE SAME; EMAILS W/JMR RE SAME;	325.00	1.00	325.00
1/27/2022	Paul Harrigan	FORMAT DECLARATION RE SUPPLEMENTAL FILING ISO PRELIMINARY APPROVAL; EMAILS W/JMR/HHK LOGISTICS OF 1/28/22 SUPPLEMENTAL PRELIMINARY APPROVAL FILING;	325.00	0.70	227.50
1/28/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW/FORMAT/FINALIZE/FILE SUPPLEMENTAL INFO ISO PRELIMINARY APPROVAL; EMAILS/CALL W/JMR RE SAME; LRS/INDIVIDUAL PRACTICES RESEARCH RE SAME; PREP CHAMBERS COPIES PACKAGE; EMAIL TO ATTN SERVICE RE SAME;	325.00	1.00	325.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

1/31/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAILS FROM ATTNYS SERVICE RE COURTESY COPIES DELIVERY;	325.00	0.20	65.00
2/14/2022	Paul Harrigan	EMAIL SEARCH FOR SERVICE OF SUBPOENA ON DEFENSE COUNSEL; EMAILS W/ZM RE PROPOER SERVICE RE SUBPOENAS VS. NOTICES OF SUBPOENA;	325.00	0.50	162.50
2/16/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAILS FROM JMR/ZM RE DOC SUBPOENA ON 3RD PARTY IHERB;	325.00	0.30	97.50
2/18/2022	Paul Harrigan	PHONE CALL W/ZM RE 3RD PART SUBPOENA SERVICE ISSUES; EMAILS W/ZM RE SAME; REVIEW PREVIOUS SUBPOENAS RE SAME; REVIEW EMAILS RE ZM SERVING SUBPOENA;	325.00	0.80	260.00
2/25/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAILS B/T ZM/ATTNYS SERVICE RE SERVING 3RD PARTY SUBPOENA ON VITACOST; REVIEW DOCS RE SAME;	325.00	0.30	97.50
2/28/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW ORDER/DOCKET ENTRY GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL; REVIEW EMAILS/RETURNED POS RE 3RD PARTY SUBPOENA ON VITACOST;	325.00	0.40	130.00
3/10/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW EMAILS W/JMR/HHK RE FILING SUPPLEMENT RE CLASS NOTICE; DOCKET CHECK RE SAME;	325.00	0.50	162.50
3/14/2022	Paul Harrigan	REVIEW ORDER APPROVING CLASS NOTICE;	325.00	0.20	65.00

EXCEL RECORD - GLANCY PRONGAY MURRAY TIME RECORDS

2/8/2022	Zabella Moore	COMMUNICATE WITH OPPOSING COUNSEL, ATTORNEY, DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, DRAFT CORRESPONDENCE	325.00	1.00	325.00
2/21/2022	Zabella Moore	COMMUNICATE WITH OPPOSING COUNSEL, ATTORNEY, DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, DRAFT CORRESPONDENCE	325.00	1.00	325.00
3/1/2022	Zabella Moore	COMMUNICATION WITH ATTORNEY, OPPOSING COUNSEL, RESEARCH, DRAFTING	325.00	4.00	1,300.00
3/3/2022	Zabella Moore	COMMUNICATION WITH ATTORNEY, DOCKETING, RESEARCH, DRAFTING	325.00	4.00	1,300.00